

SALINAS HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD

Staff Report

City of Salinas

Community Development
Department
65 West Alisal Street
Salinas, CA 93901
(831) 758-7206
(831) 758-7215 fax

Director:
Megan Hunter

Planning Manager:
Courtney Grossman

Historic Resources Board:

*Ruth Anderson
Meg Clovis, Vice Chairperson
Sal Munoz
Carey Pearce, Chairperson
Thom Taft
Mowafiq Al-Anazi
Vacant*

Planning Manager Approval	Agenda Item
---------------------------	-------------

DATE: August 5, 2019
TO: Historic Resources Board
FROM: Bobby Latino, Associate Planner
BY: Bobby Latino, Associate Planner
SUBJECT: SHCA 2019-002: Request for a determination that the single-family dwelling located at 439 Soledad Street is not a historic resource as defined by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

RECOMMENDATION

Consider affirming the findings and adopting the attached Resolution determining that the single-family dwelling located at 439 Soledad Street is not considered a historic resource as defined by CEQA.

BACKGROUND

Interim, Inc., property owner, is requesting a determination that the subject single-family dwelling is not considered a historic resource as defined by CEQA. Interim, Inc. has applied for a Site Plan Review to demolish the single-family dwelling and construct a new multifamily dwelling project with site improvements.

1989 City Historical & Architectural Survey prepared by Kent Seavey

The single-family dwelling in question is included in the 1989 City Historical & Architectural Survey prepared by Kent Seavey. The survey describes the building as a one-story wood framed, side gabled cottage, rectangular in pattern. The exterior wall cladding appears to be a wide horizontal metal or vinyl siding in a clapboard style. A gabled wall dormer with return is above the offset and

recessed entry which is characterized by a Georgian frontispiece in the form of broken pediment with central urn. The recessed entry is paneled. Fenestration is uniformly 6/9 double hung wood sash in the three windows along the façade. These have two panel shutters with a pierced floral decoration in the top panel of each. This curious late Colonial Revival cottage just may have been a center gabled Itlalianate structure like some of its neighbors and radically remodeled, including a one bay expansion to the south. The entry gable and recessed doorway suggest this, but physical examination would be necessary to prove this thesis.

The 1925 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map shows a building in plan at this location not dissimilar to that at 415 Soledad Street. The configuration of the late Colonial Revival cottage now there suggests, as mentioned in the description, that the original center gabled Itlalianate of the 1870's was extensively remodeled into its current configuration. This, of course, is conjecture until a physical examination of the structure can prove the thesis. Notwithstanding the above, 439 Soledad Street stands on its own as an interesting builder's interpretation of the late Colonial style. Its scale to the street, landscaping and setbacks make it a contributing feature of the Eastend historic district and its exhibition of changing fashion in architecture is likely to yield information important to the history of the district. It should be listed as a contribution structure under Criterion 4, h, m.

CEQA Definition of a Historic Resource

If a site has been surveyed as historic in a historical resource survey, then it is deemed a historical resource in accordance with CEQA Section 15064.5(a)(2). In determining the significance of impacts to historical resources, CEQA Section 15064.5(a)(2) states the term "historical resources" shall include a resource included in a local register of historical resources, as defined in Section 5020.1(k) of the Public Resources Code or identified as significant in an historical resource survey meeting the requirements in Section 5024.1(g) of the Public Resources Code, shall be presumed to be historically or culturally significant. Section 5024.1(g) of the Public Resources Code states a resource identified as significant in an historical resource survey may be listed in the California Register if the survey meets all of the following criteria:

- (1) The survey has been or will be included in the State Historic Resources Inventory.
- (2) The survey and the survey documentation were prepared in accordance with office procedures and requirements.
- (3) The resource is evaluated and determined by the office to have a significance rating of Category 1 to 5 on DPR Form 523.
- (4) If the survey is five or more years old at the time of its nomination for inclusion in the California Register, the survey is updated to identify historical resources which have become eligible or ineligible due to changed circumstances or further documentation and

those which have been demolished or altered in a manner that substantially diminishes the significance of the resource.

Public agencies must treat any such resource as significant unless the preponderance of evidence demonstrates that it is not historically or culturally significant.

ANALYSIS

2019 Kent Seavey Assessment

Interim, Inc, contracted with Kent Seavey to reassess the subject single-family dwelling as having contributing factors to historic setting and integrity. Kent Seavey's assessment dated March 28, 2019 (see attached) stated that the two contributing factors of historic setting and integrity for consideration of listing either Nationally, State, or locally are not met. The historic integrity of the original design was compromised by numerous inappropriate additions and alterations over time, that have obscured and damaged original materials and workmanship, while lacking any architectural distinction. Although the site retains its original location its historic setting (i.e. neighborhood context) has been severely compromised by the construction of a modern motel complex at the corner of Soledad and John Streets, which saw the removal of a highly significant anchor building for the proposed 1989 Eastend Historical District.

2019 Past Consultants Peer Review of Kent Seavey Assessment

Interim, Inc. contracted with Past Consultants, LLC to conduct a peer review of Kent Seavey's Assessment dated March 28, 2019. In a peer review by Past Consultants dated May 22, 2019 (see attached), Kent Seavey's Assessment dated March 28, 2019 is confirmed in that the numerous changes to the building have removed the historic integrity from the building. These changes render the subject property ineligible for consideration of listing either Nationally, State, or locally.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The City of Salinas has determined that the proposed action is not a project as defined by the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) per CEQA Guidelines Section 15378(b)(5), which addresses organizational or administrative activities of governments that will not result in direct or indirect physical changes in the environment. Conversely, if the Historic Resource Board, finds that the property is considered a historic resource under CEQA, then future demolition and construction would be subject to further CEQA review.

Typically, demolition permits, Site Plan Review approvals, and building permits are considered Ministerial Acts per CEQA Section 15268.

FINDINGS

Findings in support of the determination that the subject single-family dwelling is not considered a historic resource as defined in CEQA are included in the attached resolution.

TIME CONSIDERATION

There is no legal deadline to take action on this item because it is not considered a development project pursuant to Government Code Section 66000 or considered a project under CEQA per Section 15378(b)(5).

ALTERNATIVES AVAILABLE TO THE BOARD

The Historic Resources Board has the following alternatives:

1. Affirm the findings in support of the determination that the subject single-family dwelling is not considered a historic resource as defined by CEQA, with modifications; or
2. Find that the subject single-family dwelling is considered a historic resource as defined in CEQA and establish findings at the public hearing in support of the determination.

CONCLUSION

In accordance with Section 3-02.04 of the Salinas Municipal Code, the determination that the subject single-family dwelling is not considered a historic resource as defined by CEQA has been delegated to the Historic Resources Board.

COURTNEY GROSSMAN
Planning Manager

BY: _____
Bobby Latino
Associate Planner

Attachments: Proposed Historic Resources Board Resolution
 1989 City Historical & Architectural Survey (State of California
 Department of Parks and Recreation Form)
 Kent Seavey's Assessment dated March 28, 2019
 Past Consultants Peer Review dated May 22, 2019