

REPORT TO THE CITY COUNCIL

City of Salinas, California

DATE: September 13, 2016

FROM: Cary Ann Siegfried, Director of Libraries and Community Services

SUBJECT: **PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH ANDERSON BRULÉ
ARCHITECTS, INC. FOR THE EL GABILAN LIBRARY
IMPROVEMENT PROJECT**

RECOMMENDATION:

It is recommended that the City Council approve a resolution authorizing the City Manager and City Attorney to enter into an agreement for professional services with Anderson Brulé Architects, Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$396,212 to plan for improvements to the El Gabilan Branch Library.

DISCUSSION:

Background

The 3,000 square-foot El Gabilan Library was constructed in 1966 at 1400 North Main Street and has served this neighborhood for the last 50 years, currently averaging over 200 visitors each day. When the California State Library's Library Development Services Division released a report identifying state-wide needs for new library infrastructure in 2007, the El Gabilan Branch of the Salinas Public Library system was shown to be in need of a remodel and expansion of up to 15,000 square feet.

In 1976 when the Northpoint Apartments were built, the adjacent parcel at 1410 North Main Street was granted to the City for future development. The two parcels together (1400 and 1410 North Main Street) at the intersection of Navajo and North Main Street, equal 2.01 acres and have been long proposed for the expansion of the library, though the decades-long plan for redeveloping the library was hindered due to lack of available funds.

On October 21, 2014, the City Council made the first steps toward a plan for expanding this library facility by adopting a resolution to approve a ground lease with allUS Credit Union at 1410 North Main Street and to approve the use of the revenue associated with the lease for expanding the existing library or building a new library facility. In order to secure the lease and to build a new 5,000 square foot credit union at 1410 North Main Street, allUS Credit Union agreed to advance the City 40-years of lease payments, with a 5% escalator at each five-year interval, resulting in a payment of \$1,403,719. In addition, the City and the credit union have shared expenses for the environmental assessment, traffic study and mitigation plan, geo-technical studies and property survey for the site.

The site plan specified in the Ground Lease called for the credit union to begin construction first, leaving adequate space and accommodations for the library to follow. The new allUS Credit Union's grand opening took place in July 2016 and has paved the way for work to begin on the library expansion project.

Project Scope of Work

In order to expedite the work necessary to the project, the following tasks were determined to be part of this initial phase:

- Engage the community to develop a shared vision for the El Gabilan Branch Library.
- Determine the space needs to fulfill the shared vision and meet funding goals. While 15,000 square feet was initially projected, the community engagement phase will assist in ensuring that space is sufficient for community needs.
- Prepare a comprehensive and complete program addressing the service to be functions performed by the library.
- Building on the work already completed in concert with the allUS Credit Union construction project, complete the site assessment work necessary for the planned expansion of the current building or construction of a new building.
- Develop preliminary design drawings and architectural renderings focusing on site plan, building plans fitted to the proposed site, furnishing plans, exterior elevations, and preliminary building systems.
- Provide a total project cost estimate that includes all hard and soft costs related to the design and the construction of the new library including, but not limited to, furniture and equipment, project management, fees and contingencies. Provide a complete proposed project schedule including realistic deadlines for future design development and construction phases.

Completion of the above tasks will allow the city to make informed and prudent decisions in moving ahead to the construction phase of the project.

Consultant Selection Process

A Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for improvements to the El Gabilan Branch Library was released on May 2, 2016, calling for proposals to be submitted on or prior to June 2, 2016. The RFQ was posted on the City of Salinas web site, as well as on Planet Bids. Both of these postings are standard process for Requests of this type. Planet Bids, utilized by the City for approximately the last two years, serves to automate the procurement process to allow vendors to set up a profile and be automatically notified when requests/bids are posted that meet their criteria. Automating this notification makes the process fair and efficient for both the vendor and the City, eliminating possibilities for the perception of preferential treatment and ensuring that vendors do not miss an opportunity to respond.

The evaluation criteria clearly specified in the Request are listed below:

- a) Professional background and qualifications of key personnel, including demonstrated creativity in developing library building design solutions, proven commitment to and track-record of completing sustainable development projects, as well as demonstrated skill in designing and implementing meaningful public engagement processes (30%)*

- b) *Previous experience with projects of similar scope and similar technical requirements and a history of bringing projects in on time and on budget (25%)*
- c) *References of previous clients; quality and completeness of prior work; reputation for professional integrity and competence (25%)*
- d) *The feasibility and applicability of the consultant's proposed project methodology to this project, as well as the feasibility of the timeline/schedule proposed (20%).*
- e) *Capability to perform all aspects of the project, or to demonstrate relationships with sub-consultants who are capable of the work (PASS/FAIL)*

While local preference was not stated specifically above as part of the evaluation criteria, this is a standard part of all procurement processes, required by the local preference ordinance and it was considered in the evaluation of the proposals received. In the assignment of points, local vendors were given an automatic increase of 10% (or 10 points). Two firms based in Monterey County received the additional 10 points to the 100 points possible in the evaluation process.

The eight proposals received were reviewed carefully and scored numerically on the criteria specified above by a committee of four staff from the Public Works and Library and Community Services Departments. The results of this initial evaluation, including the average score awarded for each category are depicted in Table 1 below:

Table 1: Round 1 Scoring

Firm	a) Prof. Bckgrd. (30 pts.)	b) Previous Exp. (25 pts.)	c) References (25 pts., not scored in initial round)	d) Feasibility (20 pts.)	e) Capability (Pass/Fail)	Total	Local Pref.	Adj. Total
Anderson Brulé, San Jose, CA	27.25	22.75	N/A	19.5	PASS (4)	69.5	0	69.5
Griffin Structures, Inc., Santa Clara CA	26.5	22.5	N/A	16	PASS (4)	64.5	0	64.5
Group 4, San Francisco, CA	27.5	24.5	N/A	19.5	PASS (4)	71.25	0 0	71.25
IBI Group, San Jose, CA	27.25	23	N/A	19.25	PASS (4)	69.5	0 0	69.5
Johnson Favaro, Culver City, CA	24.75	22.75	N/A	18.5	PASS (4)	66	0	66
Kasavan Architects, Salinas CA	18.75	17.75	N/A	15.25	PASS (3) FAIL (1)	51.75	10	61.75
Noll & Tam, Berkeley, CA	25.5	22.25	N/A	18.5	PASS (4)	66.25	0 0	66.25
Wald, Ruhnke & Dost, Monterey, CA	20.25	18.75	N/A	14	PASS (4)	53	10	63

The review committee was in unanimous agreement on the selection of the four finalists chosen for interviews. All firms chosen as finalists had extensive experience in designing public libraries, are involved in professional library organizations that facilitate their knowledge of library service and technology trends and they received high scores for professional background and qualifications and for previous experience with similar projects. All four finalists also have resources within their firms to perform both the community engagement and programming functions, as well as the more technical aspects of the project.

As noted above, the local preference ordinance was applied to the scores. Both Monterey County firms scored substantially lower than the other firms, despite the addition of the local preference points, for the following reasons:

- 1) Both firms had very minimal experience in successful public library design projects; and
- 2) While the need for detailing a strong community engagement process was stressed in the RFQ, this was not addressed by these firms as fully as in the proposals submitted by the four finalists.

The four finalists were interviewed by a panel consisting of staff from the Public Works, Library and Community Services and Community Development departments and a representative from the Library and Community Services Commission. This process resulted in the following adjusted scores in Table 2 below (first round scoring averaged with the scoring of the interview process). The final score also included an assessment of references from other similar projects.

Table 2: Final Scoring

Firm	Adj. Average Score
Anderson Brulé, San Jose, CA	93.85
Group 4, San Francisco, CA	89.23
IBI Group, San Jose, CA	83.45
Noll & Tam, Berkeley, CA	86.93

The following points should be emphasized regarding this selection process:

- A public library is a unique type of building and because of the public service requirements of the building, as well as the concerns regarding operating efficiency, a track record of proven excellence in designing buildings of this type may be of greater importance than for other public buildings. An inefficient design can result in higher than necessary annual operating costs that will burden the City's budget for years to come.
- Local preference was applied in this situation, as is standard. All proposals were evaluated in an ethical and fair manner using the criteria clearly stated in the RFQ document. The local preference

ordinance exists, not to automatically award contracts to local firms but to give preference to local firms amongst equally qualified ones. In this case, the local firms were not equally qualified.

Anderson Brulé Architects, Inc.

Anderson Brulé Architects specializes in the Community, Education, and Health and Wellness markets and provides complete services in strategic planning, architecture and interiors. The firm has been responsible for the programming, design and construction of numerous public library facilities in California, as well as nationally, including five branch libraries for the City of San Jose, and most recently, an award-winning joint library between a community college and public library in Virginia Beach, Virginia. Projects such as this recent joint venture, as well as the Martin Luther King Jr. Joint-Use Library in San Jose speak to the firm's ability to design and implement a community engagement process that listens to the community being served and creates a shared vision for library services.

The negotiated scope of work outlined in the Professional Services Agreement effectively illustrates all components of the community engagement process, combined with the assessment, programming and technical requirements necessary for the planning of a branch library that will meet the current and future needs of the Salinas community. Staff from the firm assigned to the team have extensive professional experience in designing public library facilities and are well-versed in library design trends and efficiencies. As a result, the end product is anticipated to be an attractive building, but also, an efficient building that will result in the best outcome for operating costs for years to come.

ISSUE:

Shall the City Council approve a resolution authorizing the City Manager and City Attorney to execute a professional services agreement with Anderson Brulé Architects, Inc. for the El Gabilan Branch Library Improvement Project?

FISCAL IMPACT:

The authorized Agreement amount is not to exceed \$396,212. The funding for this Agreement is in the City's FY 2016-2017 Capital Improvement Program Budget, CIP Project 9166 (New El Gabilan Library)

TIME CONSIDERATIONS:

The selection of a consultant and the execution of an agreement for a negotiated scope of work is the first step toward providing improved library services in the northern part of Salinas. It is important that the community remain engaged and have confidence that the City is moving the process forward in a timely manner in order to meet community needs for literacy, self-directed education and quality of life through the provision of excellent library services.

ALTERNATIVES:

As alternatives to approving this resolution, the City Council could:

1. adopt the resolution with modifications;

2. take no action regarding this resolution;
3. request that staff negotiate the agreement, scope of work and budget and return to the Council for further consideration;
4. direct staff to reissue an RFQ, or
5. other actions the City Council deems appropriate in this matter.

Without an executed agreement with the selected consultant team, the El Gabilan Branch Library Improvement project will be delayed.

CITY COUNCIL GOALS:

Expanding the El Gabilan Branch Library is a FY 2016-17 Key Strategy in support of the **City Council Strategic Plan Goal V: Quality of Life.**

CONCLUSION:

Based on the firm's extensive experience in the community engagement process, their expertise in programming and designing library buildings that are efficient and attractive and most notably, because of the strong and positive relationships that they have demonstrated with previous municipal clients, it is recommended the Council approve the Professional Services Agreement with Anderson Brulé Architects, Inc. to plan for the future of the El Gabilan Branch Library.

ATTACHMENTS:

Resolution
Professional Services Agreement
Professional Services Agreement Exhibit A
Anderson Brulé Architects presentation